

Keeping Our Cool: In Defense of Air Conditioning

Arthur M. Diamond, Jr.*

University of Nebraska Omaha

Department of Economics

Omaha, NE 68182-0048

Phone: (402) 554-3657

e-Mail: adiamond@unomaha.edu

* I thank the inventors and innovators whose creation of air conditioning has allowed me to think more clearly. An earlier draft of the paper was presented at the meetings of the Association of Private Enterprise Education (APEE).

Abstract

In the last 15 years three books have been published that are critical of air conditioning (Cooper 1998; Ackermann 2002; Cox 2010). No books (or even articles) in those years have been primarily devoted to a general defense. Such a defense should make the following points. Air conditioners reduce disease and mortality, especially among the ill and aged. They reduce aggressive behavior, including road rage, assaults, and murders. They increase the quality and quantity of nighttime sleep. They improve student and worker productivity by reducing noise and increasing the ability to concentrate. They increase comfort and free choice.

JEL Codes: I18 (Health: Government Policy; Regulation; Public Health), O33 (Technological Change: Choices and Consequences; Diffusion Processes), J24 (Labor Productivity)

Keywords: air conditioning; disease; aggression; productivity; comfort; free choice

I. The Attack on Air Conditioning

Critics of capitalism used to claim that capitalism either never was capable of making life better for the common person, or that it would develop in a way that eventually made it incapable of making life better for the common person. Marx, for instance sometimes seemed to argue that the worker's lot was always terrible under capitalism (e.g., in *The Communist Manifesto*) but at other times seemed to give credit to capitalism for improving the lot of the worker compared to the barbarous or feudal systems that preceded capitalism (e.g., in his "British Rule in India" report¹).

But at least since the collapse of the communism around the world, it is clear to anyone with open eyes that capitalism produces the goods, and can improve living standards for all parts of society.² As a result, some of the critics became less critical. But other critics simply looked for new grounds for criticism. One major ground has been the environmental case: capitalism may produce the goods, but only at too high a price in terms of damage to the environment.³ Another ground has been to criticize the goods that capitalism produces. This ground argues, not that capitalism fails to produce the goods, but that when better examined, the goods are not really good.

And so we see a stream of books and articles claiming that plentiful food is bad,⁴ and cars

¹ For example (Marx 2003 [1853], p. 118): "I do not allude to European despotism, planted upon Asiatic despotism, by the British East India Company, forming a more monstrous combination than any of the divine monsters startling us in the temple of Salsette."

² Versions of this view have been widely expressed, e.g., in: Fukuyama 1992; Thomas Friedman 2000; and Yergin and Stanislaw 1998.

³ For a discussion of environmentalism as an attack of capitalism, see: Klaus 2008.

⁴ Hager 2008 has described how the Haber-Bosch technology allowed fertilizing nitrogen to be created out of the air, thereby saving millions from starvation.

are bad,⁵ and television is bad,⁶ and computers are bad,⁷ and air conditioning is bad. My belief is that these claims are generally unsound, and that if they go unanswered, a system that has been enormously successful will be undermined, leading to shorter, and less happy and less free lives.

The intellectual critics of capitalism's triumphs have often been more numerous and more vocal than the defenders, nowhere more so than in the case of air conditioning. In the last 15 years at least three books have been published that are mainly critical of air conditioning (Cooper 1998; Ackermann 2002; Cox 2010). After some sustained search, I have found no books whose main purpose is to describe the benefits of air conditioning.⁸ I have not even uncovered any substantial article-length general summary of the benefits of air conditioning.⁹

What does exist, and what will be made use of here, are articles that document specific harms from heat, and specific benefits from air conditioning. In making the case for air conditioning, I will mainly focus on the benefits of air conditioning. I will mainly leave to others, or to another time and place, the discussion of the alleged costs of air conditioning. For now a few words on costs will have to suffice.

The main costs of air conditioning are usually claimed to be the environmental damage that is alleged from the increase in global warming due to the increased energy consumption that results from running the air conditioners. I believe a strong case can, and has, been made that these concerns are substantially overblown for several reasons. First, some phenomena often

⁵ For articulate defenses of the automobile, see: Lomasky 1997, Tierney 2004, and Wilson 1997.

⁶ Johnson 2006 argues for cognitive benefits from television and video games.

⁷ Part of Gates 1995 is devoted to describing and predicting how personal computers make life better. Shirky 2010 describes and predicts some benefits from innovative collaboration made possible by the internet. McGonigal 2011 praises the benefits of video games, especially those that are cooperative.

⁸ Schultz (2012b) discusses some of the benefits of air conditioning, but his book is mainly intended to be "a coffee-table history of the company" (Schultz 2012a).

⁹ A partial exception is Robert Friedman 1984. Heppenheimer 2005 recounts the history of the development and adoption of the air conditioner, but is not primarily concerned with the benefits and costs. By "substantial" I mean something more than a brief personal commentary.

attributed to global warming may be due to periodic and hard-to-predict natural variations.¹⁰

Second, global warming creates opportunities¹¹ in addition to problems, e.g., it would reduce the costs of shipping over,¹² communicating in,¹³ and retrieving oil and minerals from the arctic,¹⁴

and would increase agriculture and animal husbandry in places like Britain¹⁵ and Greenland.¹⁶

Third, other problems exceed in severity any problems caused by global warming.¹⁷ Fourth and

finally, in a system of entrepreneurial capitalism, creative inventors will find ways to reduce

global warming,¹⁸ and innovative entrepreneurs¹⁹ will find ways to adapt to it²⁰ or make use of

it.²¹

II. What Is Beneficial?

People differ on their view of the most comfortable temperature. But air conditioning need not impose a particular temperature on everyone. Air conditioning opens the possibility

¹⁰ See, e.g., Bhanoo 2009; and Hansen 2009.

¹¹ E.g., see distinguished scientist and futurist Freeman Dyson's case that the benefits from global warming may exceed the costs: Dawidoff 2009.

¹² E.g.: Kramer and Revkin 2009.

¹³ E.g.: Joling 2010.

¹⁴ E.g.: Kramer and Krauss 2011; Revkin 2008; Mouawad 2008; and Krauss 2005.

¹⁵ E.g.: Naik 2010.

¹⁶ E.g.: Faris 2008; and Etter 2006.

¹⁷ E.g.: Lomborg December 15, 2009; Lomborg, November 9, 2009; Lomborg, November 2, 2009; and Lomborg, October 23, 2009.

¹⁸ E.g.: "Bacteria and Climate Change; . . ." 2010; Stephens 2009; Hotz 2007.

¹⁹ One of the advantages of flexible economic systems, such as capitalism, is that they can adapt to unexpected or exogenous changes in the environment (e.g., changes in the weather). In the empirical analysis quoted from below, the primary finding is that roughly half of the short-term negative effects on income from rising temperatures, "are offset in the long run through adaptation." Almost all of the countries in the sample of 12 deviate substantially from the ideal of entrepreneurial capitalism. So the reduction by half is probably a much smaller amount of adaptation than would occur in a sample of countries that had adopted policies that allowed a flourishing of entrepreneurship. "Using subnational data from 12 countries in the Americas, we show that the negative cross-sectional relationship between temperature and income exists within countries, as well as across countries. We then provide a theoretical framework for reconciling the substantial, negative association between temperature and income in cross section with the even stronger short-run effects of temperature shown in panel models. The theoretical framework suggests that half of the negative short-term effects of temperature are offset in the long run through adaptation." (Dell, Jones, and Olken 2009, p. 203)

²⁰ E.g., Ouroussoff 2010; Sengupta 2009. On the adaptability of Paleolithic humans major climate change, see: Rothstein 2010.

²¹ E.g.: Revkin 2009.

that each of us has control of the temperature that we experience. In enlightened office buildings, workers have the freedom to choose the temperature in the space that they occupy. And in their own homes, owners have the freedom to choose the setting of their thermostats. Whatever their view of the good life, whatever their concept of happiness, scholars as diverse as Milton Friedman (e.g., Friedman and Friedman 1980) and global survey researcher Ronald Inglehart (e.g., Inglehart and Welzel 2005) agree that a substantial majority of people want to be free to choose.²²

So one criterion for judging the benefits of a good like air conditioning is the extent to which it increases people's sense of choice and control over their lives. Beyond that, evaluating the benefits of a good requires knowing what life plans it enhances or hinders. So a secondary criterion would be the extent to which the product enhances a wide set of plausible, actually chosen life plans. A likely candidate for such a good would be one of those that Rawls (1971) described as "basic goods," those that are needed to achieve almost any life plan, e.g., health, longevity, food, clothing, and shelter.²³ Air conditioning is similarly a basic good for many popular and defensible life plans (though perhaps for not so broad a group as health, longevity and the like). Air conditioning will be useful whether your view of the good life is to write the great American novel, watch a good movie, or invent a better battery.

The household production approach originated by Gary Becker,²⁴ and most notably

²² E.g.: "As we demonstrated in Chapter 6, opportunities for making autonomous choices are closely linked with human happiness. This association holds true in a systematic way that operates across cultures: in all cultural zones, societies that offer their people more room for choice produce higher levels of overall life satisfaction and happiness. A society's level of subjective well being is a strong indicator of the human condition, and it is systematically linked with freedom of choice." (Inglehart and Welzel 2005, p. 288)

²³ Some may recoil at the use of Rawls as part of a case for capitalism, since his own position was not solidly supportive of capitalism. But Rawls fundamental analytic tools may be sound or useful, even if his own extended application of them is not. Recall that in his Preface to the second volume of *Law, Legislation and Liberty*, F.A. Hayek wrote (p. xiii) of Rawls' *A Theory of Justice* that: ". . . the differences between us seemed more verbal than substantial" and ". . . we agree on what is the essential point."

²⁴ Examples of Becker's approach can be found in Michael and Becker 1973 and Stigler and Becker 1977.

developed in Michael and Becker (1973) is in some ways a similar approach to that of Rawls. In Becker's view the household combines market goods with time in order to produce the "commodities" that yield utility. (Biddle (2008, p. 420) has explicitly argued for treating air conditioning as a market good that enters the household production function.) The market goods in this approach are instrumental in producing the higher order goods (a.k.a. "commodities"), similar to how Rawls' basic goods are instrumental to achieving various conceptions of the good life.

In both the Rawls and Becker approaches there is a simple hierarchy in which basic goods are the foundation for achieving higher order goods. We could go further and plausibly, but more controversially, endorse more complex hierarchies of values like that endorsed by the great Austrian economist Carl Menger (1981), or more famously, by the psychologist Abraham Maslow (1954).²⁵ In this view, economic systems that best allow us to move up the hierarchy of values, are candidates for the best systems.

For our purposes it is not necessary to decide which of these views is closest to being correct. If we can show that a good is one of Rawls' basic goods, or one of Becker's market goods, or one of the goods at the base of a Mengerian or Maslovian hierarchy, then we will have made a strong and robust case that the good produces benefits.²⁶

²⁵ Schumpeter 1950, p. 131 mentioned "the fact that as higher standards of life are attained, these wants automatically expand and new wants emerge or are created, . . ." He footnotes this passage with the comment that "Wilhelm Wundt called this the Heterogony of Aims . . ." (Wundt is viewed as one of the founders of psychology.) A rich array of economists have adopted what has been called a hierarchical value theory, the best known version of which is that now associated with the psychologist Maslow. Perhaps the most notable economist to propound such a theory was Carl Menger, the founder of the Austrian School of economics, and the teacher of Schumpeter's teachers in Vienna. (On the history of hierarchical value theory in economics, see: Drakopoulos and Karayiannis 2004.)

²⁶ By focusing on the contribution of air conditioning to free choice and to the basic goods, we will perforce neglect some costs and benefits that have been alleged for air conditioning. For example, a producer of country music in Nashville was once quoted as claiming: "air conditioning is going to ruin country music. A country boy has got to sweat or he ain't nothing" (Fox 1979). It would take too much time both to establish the truth of the producer's causal claim, and then, if true, to further establish whether the result should be counted as a cost or a benefit.

III. The History of Air Conditioning

Control of body temperature in the face of wide variations in climate, has been key to the comfort, and even the survival of humanity, going back many thousands of years.

Anthropologist Brian Fagin has gone so far as to speculate (p. 13) that the key technology that led to the survival of our Cro-Magnon ancestors and whose absence led to the extinction of Neanderthal humans, was the eyed needle, which allowed the sewing together of animal skins in layered ways that provided Cro-Magnons greater warmth in cold climates.

Robert Gordon (2000) suggests that we look at the images collected by Otto Bettmann (1974) in order to fully understand and appreciate the beneficial effects of the inventions that came with the industrial revolution.²⁷ In the section on “Summer” in the chapter on “Air” Bettmann calls air conditioning a “blessing” and includes an artist’s sketch with the following caption: “New York’s slum dwellers escape from their windowless hovels. “On a hot night the streets are filled with families all panting and praying for fresh air” (Bettmann 1974, p. 13).

Heppenheimer (2005) claims that the human effort to cool their living quarters is widespread and ancient. He says there is evidence that “ancient Greeks, Romans, Jews, and Chinese all collected ice and snow for cooling.” He specifically mentions that a caliph from the eighth-century, Mahdi of Baghdad, forced hundreds of slaves to carry snow from the mountains to keep his summer palace cool.

²⁷ To introduce his own discussion of the benefits of the industrial revolution in his *Journal of Economic Perspectives* article, Robert Gordon writes: “To understand the profound sense in which the great inventions of the Second Industrial Revolution altered the standard of living of the average American resident, we begin with a brief tour of some of the less desirable aspects of living in the late nineteenth century. An eye-opening introduction to the conditions of that era is provided in a little-known book by Otto Bettmann (1974), the founder of the famed Bettmann photographic archive, and I paraphrase and quote from that book in the next four paragraphs” (Gordon 2000, p. 58; in the quote I have corrected Gordon’s misspelling of Bettmann’s last name).

Streever mentions (2009, pp. 161-164) that Cornelis Drebbel cooled Westminster Abbey in 1620 for King James I, whose girth and attire contributed to his being uncomfortably warm in the summer. Apparently it is not known exactly how he did this, although it has been speculated that he used a combination of preserved snow, and potassium nitrate that, when mixed with snow, absorbs heat.

Bryson (2010, pp. 123-124) has noted that the middle class were quicker to install gas lighting in their homes than were the rich. His explanation is that the great benefit of gas lighting in the home was to reduce the time and effort for performing a variety of services. But this was mainly a benefit to those who performed the routine and exhausting services. The rich had servants to perform these services for them; the middle class were more on their own.

For a more recent example, consider Crowell's observation (1997) that in 1948, before air conditioners were widespread, rich Washington, D.C. hostesses would entertain guests in the summer by chartering Potomac river cruise ships for the evening, an expedient presumably not available to the capitol's poor and middle class.

These episodes suggest that air conditioners might be another example of Schumpeter's claim that the glory of capitalism is that it brings within the reach of ordinary people, goods and services that was previously available only to the rich.²⁸

Ford was not the first to make a car; he was the first to make a car that the middle class could afford. Edison was not the first to make a light bulb; he was the first to make a light bulb that the middle class could afford. Carrier was not the first to invent air conditioning; he was the first to make air conditioning available to the middle class (in theaters) at a price that the middle class could afford.

²⁸ "Queen Elizabeth owned silk stockings. The capitalist achievement does not typically consist in providing more silk stockings for queens but in bringing them within the reach of factory girls in return for steadily decreasing amounts of effort." (Schumpeter 1950, p. 67)

In the era since the industrial revolution, the desire for cool relief from the heat of summer first took the form of a bold enterprise to transport lake ice wide distances. This story of entrepreneurial triumph is briefly told by Bryson (2010, pp. 71-75) and at greater length by Weightman 2003. In an example of the leapfrog competition of creative destruction, the successful innovation of distantly transported lake ice was itself creatively destroyed by the even greater related innovations of refrigeration and air conditioning.

In the two centuries, several inventors and innovators worked on developing an effective and efficient air conditioner, including John Gorrie, Nikola Tesla²⁹, Willis Carrier and Thomas Midgley. Gorrie's story is a sad one. He received a patent for his version of the air conditioner, but failed to raise sufficient funds to develop it, and died a poor and broken man (Burke 1978, p. 241).

Carrier made the large-scale air conditioner, for comfort in theaters, stores, museums and office buildings, a practical and affordable product. Carrier found a new way to dehumidify air, which he patented and continued to perfect, to great success (Johnson 2010, p. 215). In summarizing Carrier's achievement, Steven Johnson says that "Carrier's narrative fits the classic mold of the genius entrepreneur" (Johnson 2010, p. 216). Carrier's major contribution was to increase users' control of the temperature for maximum comfort (Heppenheimer 2005).³⁰

Midgley's contribution was to develop Freon, which made it possible to produce air conditioning units small enough to cool a typical home (Bernstein 2002). The pent-up demand for affordable air conditioning can be seen in the rapid rate of adoption. In the United States between 1960 and 1999, the percent of households that had air conditioning leaped from about 10% to about 70% (Moore and Simon 1999, p. 19). By The rate of adoption of air conditioning

²⁹ Hughes 1985. But Hughes does not elaborate on the nature of Tesla's work on air conditioning.

³⁰ Carrier's contributions are summarized and evaluated by Johnson (2010, pp. 214-218) who sees Carrier's story as "archtypical" in its fit with "the classic mold of the genius entrepreneur" (p. 216),

in houses is documented in the figure below.³¹

IV. Air Conditioning Extends Life

Washington, D.C. has long had the reputation of being an unhealthy swamp, both figuratively and literally. When an assassin's bullet struck President Garfield in 1881, Garfield's physician's feared that the summer heat of Washington, D.C. was impairing his recovery. At first renowned scientist Simon Newcomb was enlisted to devise a primitive air conditioner, blowing air over ice (Schwarz 2006). Eventually, he was moved to the Jersey shore where he succumbed in spite of their best efforts.³²

In August 1931, Thomas Edison was ailing in New Jersey. "Since the intense summer heat oppressed him, one of the new air-conditioning machines was installed in his bedroom, . . ." (Josephson 1959). In July 1944, part of the reason that the Bretton Woods agreement occurred at Bretton Woods, rather than the more convenient Washington, D.C., was that there were concerns whether John Maynard Keynes, who was ailing from a heart condition, could survive long meetings in the summer heat of Washington, D.C. (Moggridge 1992, pp. 737-738).

As recently as 2003, nearly 15,000 deaths in France were attributed to the lack of air conditioning during a heat wave.³³ When I complained to my wife about the lack of air conditioning in the Paris subway system, a French medical worker overheard us and interjected that the French believe that air conditioning is harmful to respiratory health. This is in fact the

³¹ Similar information on the rate of adoption of air conditioning can be found in: Moore and Simon 2000, p. 113; based on U.S. Bureau of the Census, American Housing Survey for the United States in 1997; and U.S. Bureau of the Census, Housing Then and Now," www.census.gov/hhes/www/housing/census/histcensushsg.html.

³² A fuller account of Garfield's treatment and death can be found in Millard (2011).

³³ See: "French Heat . . ." 2003; Knox 2003; and Tagliabue 2003, p. A3. See also: "The 2003 heat wave had a major effect: the overall excess mortality rate in France between August 1 and August 20 was estimated at 14800 deaths" (Vandentorren et al, 2004, p. 1519).

major counter-argument to the claim that air conditioning is beneficial to health. The claim, however, is easier to assert than to prove. One study that examined the issue concluded that: “We did not find any statistically significant associations between workplace AC and any of the health outcomes” (Sahakian et al 2009; with apologies to Deirdre McCloskey). And if air conditioning were ever found to contribute to airborne pathogens, the technology could be modified to address the concern. For example, substituting copper for the aluminum in air conditioners can substantially reduce the potential for any fungus accumulation (Weaver, Michels, and Keevil 2010).

Obesity is often identified as one of the most important risk-factors for disability, diseases such as diabetes, and early mortality. Evidence suggests that higher house temperatures are positively related to higher levels of obesity (Bo et al 2011, p. 1442).

For more general conclusions on the effect of air conditioning on mortality, we can consult the important empirical study followed a cohort of 72,740 from April 1980 through December 1985. One of the main findings was:

the death rate for persons who had central air-conditioning was 42 percent lower than the rate for persons who did not have air-conditioning, after confounding variables had been controlled for. (Rogot et al 1992)

A 2002 article surveyed many studies that relate heat to an increased risk of mortality:

The findings suggest that persons with preexisting cardiovascular and respiratory diseases have increased risk of death associated with ambient heat exposure and that risk is higher for several population groups, including the elderly, infants, and persons of low socioeconomic status. Other specific risk factors include lack of air conditioning, . . .

(Basu and Samet 2002, p. 198)³⁴

The importance of air conditioning to health was dramatically highlighted in a heat wave in Dallas. Thieves stole the air conditioning of an elderly woman, who then died of the heat. A neighbor described the theft as “murder” (Miles 2011).³⁵

V. Air Conditioning Reduces Aggression and Murder

"The day is hot, the Capulets abroad," (Shakespeare, *Romeo and Juliet* as quoted in Anderson 2001, p. 33)

A wide range of studies have presented evidence that rates of aggressive behavior increase when the subjects are in hot environments.³⁶ Often, the studies do not much discuss the ways in which the environment could or should be cooled down. But it seems a logically incontrovertible conclusion that the greater the availability of air conditioning, the cooler the living environment, and the lower the level of aggression.

Craig Anderson, a leading researcher on the relation of heat and aggression, in a brief

³⁴ Lippmann et al (2013) found that high temperatures most increased emergency room visits for males, 45-64 year olds, and rural county residents (Lippmann et al 2013). Deschenes and Greenstone (2011, p. 152) document a substantial nonlinear increase in mortality at the very high end of the temperature distribution. Fowler et al (2011) connected recent heat-related deaths in the United States to thunderstorms knocking out power for air conditioners during high heat periods. During an extreme heat event in the U.S., of those who died in their homes from heat-related causes, 91% either lacked functioning air conditioning or had the air conditioning turned off (Fowler et al 2011, p. 434).

³⁵ In his autobiography, Sam Wyly after recalling a summer in Dallas without air conditioning says: “Thank you Willis Haviland Carrier, for inventing air-conditioning. I owe you one” (2008, p. 42).

³⁶ Among the studies showing a positive relationship between heat and some form of aggression are: Anderson and Anderson 1996; Anderson and Anderson 1998; Anderson, Anderson, Dorr, DeNeve, and Flanagan 2000; Anderson, Anderson, and Deuser 1996; Anderson, Bushman, and Groom 1997; Anderson and DeLisi 2010; Baron and Bell 1975; Baron and Bell 1976; Boyanowsky 1999; Boyanowsky 2008; Boyanowsky, Calvert-Boyanowsky, Young, and Brideau 1981; Burke, Miguel, Satyanath, Dykema, and Lobell 2009; Bushman, Wang, and Anderson 2005a; Bushman, Wang, and Anderson 2005b; Carlsmith and Anderson 1979; Kenrick and MacFarlane 1984; Reifman, Larrick, and Fein 1991; Larrick et al 2011; Vrij, van der Steen, and Koppelaar 1994; Wilkowski et al 2009.

overview of the literature as of 2001, concluded: “a simple version of the heat hypothesis (e.g., Berkowitz 1993)---that people get cranky when uncomfortable---has proven surprisingly robust to all challenges. In short, excessive heat appears to cause increases in aggression in many settings” (Anderson 2001, p. 34).

VI. Air Conditioning Improves Productivity and Learning

As long ago as 1748, Montesquieu observed that heat reduces productivity, and suppresses “bold enterprise” (Montesquieu 1989 ed., p. 232; see also pp. 236, 251 and 278). We can hardly even imagine all of the ways in which air conditioning has increased productivity. For example, weaving was a difficult occupation in the early 1800s for many reasons. Open windows are a poor substitute for air conditioning, but are better than nothing. But the windows apparently had to be kept closed to keep the humidity levels high enough so that the threads would not break (Lee 1992).

Before refrigeration and air conditioning, anatomy dissections could only be done during the “dissection season” due to the quick rot and unbearable smell of corpses during the warming months of the year (Teaford 2009, p. W6).³⁷

Many have pointed out that air conditioning made it easier to live in the old South and in the Southwest.³⁸ Huntington (1924) collected data over the years 1910-1913 for men and girls making piece rate objects of hardware in Connecticut, and men making cigars in Tampa. The

³⁷ Teaford was commenting on Richardson 2008; see also Richardson 2008, p. 255.

³⁸ On air conditioning revitalizing the old South, see Arsenault 1984. On the Southwest: “liberating technology, particularly air conditioning, which was like the Oregon Trail and the railroads, opening up whole new areas for development, beginning with cities like Houston and Phoenix, . . .” (Reeves 1994). Or Yeakel approvingly quoting J. Frank Dobie: “Air conditioning ruined Texas. It made it possible for Yankees to live down here” (Yeakel 1984).

four main reliable samples consisted of a total of about 1,276 workers.³⁹ The temperature for optimum productivity of the two Connecticut samples is about 60 degrees F, and the temperature for optimum productivity of the two Tampa samples is about 65 degrees F (Huntington 1924, pp. 124 and 126). Oi (1997, pp. 121-132) presents other examples, data and analysis that strongly suggest that air conditioning increases labor productivity, especially in the South.

Just as workers produce more when they are cool, students learn more when they are cool. Schoer and Shaffran (1973) found that high temperature reduced performance in a variety of tasks, with a greater reduction occurring when the tasks were more complex. More recently: “the performance of two numerical and two language-based tests was significantly improved when the temperature was reduced from 25°C to 20°C (77°F to 68°F).” (Wargocki and Wyon 2007, p. 193) Another recent study finds that optimal performance at addition and typing tasks occurs at temperatures just below the temperature at which the subject reports the most thermal comfort (Lan, Wargocki, and Lian 2011).

Besides worker and student productivity, air conditioning can also substantially improve the productivity of machines. Before air conditioning, “swollen paper, broken thread, and dry tobacco leaf reduced profits of lithographers, textile mills, and cigar makers” (Oi 1997, p. 124). Air conditioning also improved the productivity of mainframe computers (Wyly 2008, p. 36). Today one of the main business and technological challenges for Google (and other “cloud” providers) is how to cheaply and effectively cool their massive data center server farms (Levy 2011, pp. 182-184 and 188-197).

³⁹ The main “reliable” samples in Huntington’s Figure 8 (1924, p. 124) are A, B, E and F. (C and D consist of one man each, G consists of three children typing, and I consists of 1,500 students typing. Huntington says the data on G and H are “least reliable” (1924, p. 125).)

VII. Air Conditioning Improves Comfort and Free Choice

Although, as we have seen, air conditioning provides well-documented increases in labor and machine productivity, most of the air conditioners installed in the 1920s through the 1950s were to help retailers sell goods and services, rather than to help manufacturers make the goods (Biddle 2012, pp. 1074-1077). In weighing the costs and benefits, apparently air conditioning was even more important for consumer comfort, than it was for worker productivity.

People generally seek comfort most of the time. Bill Bryson (2010, p. 135) points out that for most of its existence humanity has been consumed with simple survival, and that the use of “comfortable” in the modern sense only began with Horace Walpole in 1770. Biddle (2008, p. 420) writes that in the United States “people were enthusiastic about the idea” of air conditioning, citing a 1959 Gallup poll in which 86% of the respondents preferred an air conditioned home in preference to a home that lacked air conditioning. The importance of the comfort of air conditioning relative to other inventions is hard to measure or judge. But entrepreneur Sam Wyly (2008, p. 42) and economist Robert Gordon (2000, p. 60) have independently concluded that for anyone who has spent a summer in Texas, air conditioning is more important than the internet.

Sometimes even those who oppose air conditioning admit that it increases comfort. Robert Post quotes a “fan” of street cars who seems nostalgic for discomfort. The fan was “applauding” street cars when he remembered that they “were noisy and uncomfortable—they jolted and rocked. The seats had hard, straight backs and the only air conditioning was an open window [and] often, in the wintertime, the only warmth was from too many bodies,” (Post 1998;

bracket was in Post's version of the fan quote).⁴⁰

Morley Safer describes a painting that portrays the difficulty of transporting a soldier in Vietnam to his precious R & R:

That extraordinary technology we brought to the jungles of Southeast Asia, the well-oiled firepower, the superbly trained aircraft commander, nervously checking over his shoulder to see his cargo hadn't shifted. The door gunner on full alert, flak jacket in place, ready to fire. All to give a fella a week with his wife and air conditioning. (Safer 1991)

For those in a jungle of danger and heat and randomness, air conditioning was something to look forward to, something to fight for. Air conditioning was respite and comfort and control.

VIII. Conclusions

Schumpeter famously suggested (1950, p. 83) that the essential fact about capitalism was its dynamic process of creative destruction. For many critics, the rejection of capitalism may fundamentally be a rejection of dynamism.⁴¹ One visitor from Europe, where air conditioning is much less common,⁴² suggested that air conditioning is a symbol of the American spirit. Beppe Severgnini (according to Felton) "notes that the refusal to suffer the sweaty indignity of equatorial heat is "the antithesis of passive resignation," and thus a perfect expression of the can-do American character" (Felton 2010, p. W9).

⁴⁰ In Cuba, few have air conditioners. In some limited ways, a refrigerator is a substitute for an air conditioner. Many in Cuba have nursed along GE refrigerators that were made before the Communist revolution. These refrigerators are often viewed as prize possessions; and avant-garde artists put on a bold show honoring the GE refrigerator (Romero 2007, p. 3).

⁴¹ Postrel 1998 has suggested that the most useful political categories are not "conservative" and "liberal," but rather "stasist" and "dynamist."

⁴² When we have visited Europe in the summer we have sometimes been told that it does not get warm enough there for air conditioning to be useful---we beg to differ.

Being an open-minded, balanced, objective scholar, I must admit that there does appear to be one very substantial cost to air conditioning. Russell Baker pointed out⁴³ that before air conditioning, the stifling heat of a D.C. summer drove Congress out of town. After air conditioning, Congress has stayed in session longer, passing more laws.

⁴³ Baker was quoted in Oi 1997, p. 124, who had found it quoted in Arsenault 1984, p. 605. I first remember hearing the point made by Burt Folsom at a Young America's Foundation gathering on 8/1/05 that was broadcast on CSPAN-2 on 8/2/05.

References

- Ackermann, Marsha E. *Cool Comfort: America's Romance with Air-Conditioning*. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 2002.
- Anderson, Craig A. "Heat and Violence." *Current Directions in Psychological Science* 10 (2001): 33-38.
- Anderson, Craig A. "Temperature and Aggression: Effects on Quarterly, Yearly, and City Rates of Violent and Nonviolent Crime." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 52, no. 6 (June 1987): 1161-73.
- Anderson, Craig A., and Dona C. Anderson. "Ambient Temperature and Violent Crime: Tests of the Linear and Curvilinear Hypotheses." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 46, no. 1 (Jan. 1984): 91-97.
- Anderson, Craig A., and Kathryn B. Anderson. "Violent Crime Rate Studies in Philosophical Context: A Destructive Testing Approach to Heat and Southern Culture of Violence Effects." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 70, no. 4 (April 1996): 740-56.
- Anderson, Craig A., Kathryn B. Anderson, and William E. Deuser. "Examining an Affective Aggression Framework: Weapon and Temperature Effects on Aggressive Thoughts, Affect, and Attitudes." *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* 22, no. 4 (April 1996): 366-76.
- Anderson, Craig A., Kathryn B. Anderson, Nancy Dorr, Kristina M. DeNeve, and Mindy Flanagan. "Temperature and Aggression." In *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology*, Vol. 32., edited by Mark P. Zanna. San Diego, CA US: Academic Press, 2000, pp. 63-133.

- Anderson, Craig A., Brad J. Bushman, and Ralph W. Groom. "Hot Years and Serious and Deadly Assault: Empirical Tests of the Heat Hypothesis." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 73, no. 6 (Dec. 1997): 1213-23.
- Arsenault, Raymond. "The End of the Long Hot Summer: The Air Conditioner and Southern Culture." *The Journal of Southern History* 50 (November 1984): 597-628.
- "Bacteria and Climate Change; Invisible Carbon Pumps; a Group of Oceanic Micro-Organisms Just Might Prove a Surprising Ally in the Fight against Climate Change." *The Economist* (September 11, 2010): 96-97.
- Baker, Russell. "Sunday Observer; No Sweat." *New York Times Magazine* (Sun., July 9, 1978): 6.
- Baron, Robert A., and Paul A. Bell. "Aggression and Heat: Mediating Effects of Prior Provocation and Exposure to an Aggressive Model." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 31, no. 5 (May 1975): 825-32.
- . "Aggression and Heat: The Influence of Ambient Temperature, Negative Affect, and a Cooling Drink on Physical Aggression." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 33, no. 3 (March 1976): 245-55.
- Basu, Rupa, Brian Malig, and Bart Ostro. "High Ambient Temperature and the Risk of Preterm Delivery." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 172, no. 10 (November 2010): 1108-17.
- Basu, Rupa, and Jonathan M. Samet. "An Exposure Assessment Study of Ambient Heat Exposure in an Elderly Population in Baltimore, Maryland." *Environmental Health Perspectives* 110, no. 12 (December 2002): 1219-1224.
- Basu, Rupa, and Bart D. Ostro. "A Multicounty Analysis Identifying the Populations Vulnerable to Mortality Associated with High Ambient Temperature in California." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 168, no. 6 (2008): 632-37.

- Baumol, William J. "Education for Innovation: Entrepreneurial Breakthroughs Versus Corporate Incremental Improvements." In *Innovation Policy and the Economy*, edited by Adam B. Jaffe, Josh Lerner and Scott Stern, 33-56. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 2005.
- Bell, Paul A., and Robert A. Baron. "Aggression and Heat: The Mediating Role of Negative Affect." *Journal of Applied Social Psychology* 6, no. 1 (January-March 1976): 18-30.
- . "Environmental Influences on Attraction: Effects of Heat, Attitude Similarity, and Personal Evaluations." *Bulletin of the Psychonomic Society* 4, no. 5-A (November 1974): 479-81.
- Berkowitz, Leonard. *Aggression: Its Causes, Consequences, and Control*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 1993.
- Bernstein, Mark. "Thomas Midgley and the Law of Unintended Consequences." *Invention & Technology Magazine* 17, no. 4 (Spring 2002).
- http://www.americanheritage.com/articles/magazine/it/2002/4/2002_4_38.shtml
- Bettmann, Otto L. *The Good Old Days--They Were Terrible!* New York: Random House, 1974.
- Bhanoo, Sindya N. "Mt. Kilimanjaro's Ice Cap Continues Its Rapid Retreat, but the Cause Is Debated." *The New York Times* (Tues., November 3, 2009): A6.
- Biddle, Jeff. "Explaining the Spread of Residential Air Conditioning, 1955-1980." *Explorations in Economic History* 45, no. 4 (September 2008): 402-23.
- . "Making Consumers Comfortable: The Early Decades of Air Conditioning in the United States." *Journal of Economic History* 71, no. 4 (2011): 1078-94.
- Bo, Simona, G. Ciccone, M. Durazzo, L. Ghinamo, P. Villois, S. Canil, R. Gambino, M. Cassader, L. Gentile, and P. Cavallo-Perin. "Contributors to the Obesity and Hyperglycemia Epidemics. A Prospective Study in a Population-Based Cohort." *International Journal of Obesity* 35, no. 11 (Nov. 2011): 1442-49.

- Boyanosky, Ehor. "Violence and Aggression in the Heat of Passion and in Cold Blood: The Ecs-TC Syndrome." *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 22, no. 3-4 (May-August 1999): 257-71.
- Boyanosky, Ehor O., J. Calvert-Boyanowsky, J. Young, and L. Brideau. "Toward a Thermo-Regulatory Model of Violence." *Journal of Environmental Systems* 11, no. 1 (1981): 81-87.
- Bryson, Bill. *At Home: A Short History of Private Life*. New York: Doubleday, 2010.
- Burke, James. *Connections*. New York, NY: Little, Brown, and Co., 1978.
- Bushman, Brad J., Morgan C. Wang, and Craig A. Anderson. "Is the Curve Relating Temperature to Aggression Linear or Curvilinear? A Response to Bell (2005) and to Cohn and Rotton (2005)." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 89, no. 1 (July 2005): 74-77.
- Bushman, Brad J., Morgan C. Wang, and Craig A. Anderson. "Is the Curve Relating Temperature to Aggression Linear or Curvilinear? Assaults and Temperature in Minneapolis Reexamined." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 89, no. 1 (July 2005): 62-66.
- Carlsmith, J. Merrill, and Craig A. Anderson. "Ambient Temperature and the Occurrence of Collective Violence: A New Analysis." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 37, no. 3 (March 1979): 337-44.
- Cooper, Gail. *Air-Conditioning America: Engineers and the Controlled Environment, 1900-1960*, Johns Hopkins Studies in the History of Technology. Baltimore, Maryland: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998.
- Cox, Stan. *Losing Our Cool: Uncomfortable Truths About Our Air-Conditioned World (and Finding New Ways to Get through the Summer)*. New York: The New Press, 2010.

Crowell, A. Levitt. "In Good Hands." *American Heritage* 48, no. 8 (December 1997): 35.

<http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=aph&AN=476345&site=ehost-live>

Dawidoff, Nicholas. "The Civil Heretic." *The New York Times Magazine* (Sun., March 29, 2009): 32-39, 54, & 57-59.

Dell, Melissa, Benjamin F. Jones, and Benjamin A. Olken. "Temperature and Income: Reconciling New Cross-Sectional and Panel Estimates." *American Economic Review* 99, no. 2 (May 2009): 198-204.

Deschenes, Olivier, and Michael Greenstone. "Climate Change, Mortality, and Adaptation: Evidence from Annual Fluctuations in Weather in the US." *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics* 3, no. 4 (Oct. 2011): 152-85.

Drakopoulos, Stavros A., and Anastassios D. Karayiannis. "The Historical Development of Hierarchical Behavior in Economic Thought." *Journal of the History of Economic Thought* 26, no. 3 (2004): 363-78.

Etter, Lauren. "Feeling the Heat for Icy Greenland, Global Warming Has a Bright Side as Temperatures Inch up, Melting Glaciers Bring New Life to a Frozen Land but Could Polar Bears Vanish?" *The Wall Street Journal* (Tues., July 18, 2006): A1 & A12.

Fagan, Brian. *Cro-Magnon: How the Ice Age Gave Birth to the First Modern Humans*. New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2010.

Faris, Stephan. "Phenomenon; Ice Free; Will Global Warming Give Greenland Its Independence?" *The New York Times Magazine* (Sun., July 27, 2008): 20.

Felten, Eric. "De Gustibus; the Big Chill: Giving AC the Cold Shoulder." *The Wall Street Journal* (Fri., July 23, 2010): W9.

- Fowler, David R., Clifford S. Mitchell, Alise Brown, Tessie Pollock, Lynne A. Bratka, John Paulson, Anna C. Noller, Robert Mauskopf, Kathryn Oscanyan, Ambarish Vaidyanathan, Amy Wolkin, Ethel V. Taylor, and Rachel Radcliffe. "Heat-Related Deaths after an Extreme Heat Event -- Four States, 2012, and United States, 1999-2009." *MMWR: Morbidity & Mortality Weekly Report* 62, no. 22 (June 7, 2013): 433-36.
- Fox, William Price. "Grand Ole Opry." *American Heritage* 30, no. 2 (February-March 1979).
http://www.americanheritage.com/articles/magazine/ah/1979/2/1979_2_94.shtml
- "French Heat Toll almost 15, 000: France's Summer Heatwave Killed a Total of 14, 800 People, According to Official Figures Released on Thursday." *BBC News UK edition* (Last Updated: Thursday, September 25, 2003),
<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/3139694.stm>.
- Friedman, Milton, and Rose D. Friedman. *Free to Choose: A Personal Statement*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc., 1980.
- Friedman, Robert. "The Air-Conditioned Century." *American Heritage* 35, no. 5 (Aug./Sept. 1984): 20-33.
- Friedman, Thomas L. *The Lexus and the Olive Tree*. New York: Anchor Books, 2000.
- Fukuyama, Francis. *The End of History and the Last Man*. New York: The Free Press, 1992.
- Gates, Bill. *The Road Ahead*. New York: Viking Penguin, 1995.
- Gordon, Robert J. "Does the 'New Economy' Measure Up to the Great Inventions of the Past?" *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 14, no. 4 (Fall 2000): 49-74.
- Gregg, Willis R. "Energy from Air-Conditioning." In *Visions of Technology: A Century of Vital Debate About Machines Systems and the Human World*, edited by Richard Rhodes. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1999, pp. 115-16.

- Hager, Thomas. *The Alchemy of Air: A Jewish Genius, a Doomed Tycoon, and the Scientific Discovery That Fed the World but Fueled the Rise of Hitler*. New York: Harmony, 2008.
- Hansen, Matthew. "UNO Scientists Pinpoint Global Warming Oddity in Himalayas." *Omaha World-Herald* (Thurs., December 17, 2009): 1A-2A.
- Hayek, F.A. *Law, Legislation and Liberty, Volume 2: The Mirage of Social Justice*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1978.
- Heppenheimer, T. A. "Cold Comfort; It Took Half a Century for Air Conditioning to Become Accepted and Decades More for It to Become Universal." *Invention & Technology Magazine* 20, no. 4 (Spring 2005).
http://www.americanheritage.com/articles/magazine/it/2005/4/2005_4_26.shtml
- Hotz, Robert Lee. "Science Journal; in Case We Can't Give up the Cars -- Try 16 Trillion Mirrors." *The Wall Street Journal* (Fri., June 22, 2007): B1.
- Hughes, Thomas P. "How Did the Heroic Inventors Do It?" *Invention & Technology Magazine* 1, no. 2 (Fall 1985).
http://www.americanheritage.com/articles/magazine/it/1985/2/1985_2_18.shtml
- Huntington, Ellsworth. *Civilization and Climate*. Third ed. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1924.
- Ingels, Margaret. *Willis Haviland Carrier: Father of Air Conditioning*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday and Co., Inc., 1952.
- Inglehart, Ronald, and Christian Welzel. *Modernization, Cultural Change, and Democracy: The Human Development Sequence*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Johnson, Steven. *Everything Bad Is Good for You*. New York: Riverhead Trade, 2006.

- Johnson, Steven. *Where Good Ideas Come From: The Natural History of Innovation*. New York: Riverhead Books, 2010.
- Joling, Dan. "Loss of Arctic Ice Opens up New Cable Route." *Omaha World-Herald*, (Fri., January 22, 2010): 4A.
- Josephson, Matthew. "Edison: Last Days of the Wizard." *American Heritage* 10, no. 6 (October 1959). http://www.americanheritage.com/articles/magazine/ah/1959/6/1959_6_32.shtml
- Kenrick, Douglas T., and Steven W. MacFarlane. "Ambient Temperature and Horn Honking: A Field Study of the Heat/Aggression Relationship." *Environment and Behavior* 18, no. 2 (1986): 179-91.
- Klaus, Václav. *Blue Planet in Green Shackles: What Is Endangered: Climate or Freedom?* 2nd ed. Washington, D.C.: Competitive Enterprise Institute, 2008.
- Koeniger, A. Cash. "Climate and Southern Distinctiveness." *The Journal of Southern History* 54 (February 1988): 21-44.
- Knox, Noelle. "French Heat-Wave Toll Reaches 10,000." *USA Today online edition* (2003), http://www.usatoday.com/news/world/2003-08-21-france-heat_x.htm.
- Kramer, Andrew E., and Andrew C. Revkin. "Arctic Shortcut Beckons Shippers as Ice Thaws." *The New York Times* (Fri., September 10, 2009): A1 & A3.
- Kramer, Andrew E., and Clifford Krauss. "Russia Embraces Arctic Drilling." *The New York Times* (Weds., February 16, 2011): B1-B2.
- Krauss, Clifford, Steven Lee Myers, Andrew C. Revkin, and Simon Romero. "As Polar Ice Turns to Water, Dreams of Treasure Abound." *The New York Times* (Mon., October 10, 2005): A1 & A10-A11.
- Lan, Li, Pawel Wargocki, and Zhiwei Lian. "Quantitative Measurement of Productivity Loss Due to Thermal Discomfort." *Energy and Buildings* 43, no. 5 (May 2011): 1057-62.

Lee, Judith Yaross. "Lowell; Revisiting the Birth of Industry in America." *Invention & Technology Magazine* 7, no. 4 (Spring 1992).

http://www.americanheritage.com/articles/magazine/it/1992/4/1992_4_8.shtml

Levy, Steven. *In the Plex: How Google Thinks, Works, and Shapes Our Lives*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2011.

Lippmann, Steven J., Christopher M. Fuhrmann, Anna E. Waller, and David B. Richardson.

"Ambient Temperature and Emergency Department Visits for Heat-Related Illness in North Carolina, 2007–2008." *Environmental Research* 124 (July 2013): 35-42.

Lomasky, Loren E. "Autonomy and Automobility." *The Independent Review* 2, no. 1 (Summer 1997): 5–28.

Lomborg, Bjørn. "Climate Change and Malaria in Africa; Limiting Carbon Emissions Won't Do Much to Stop Disease in Zambia." *The Wall Street Journal* (Mon., November 2, 2009): A17.

Lomborg, Bjørn. "Global Warming as Seen from Bangladesh; Momota Begum Worries About Hunger, Not Climate Change." *The Wall Street Journal* (Mon., November 9, 2009): A17.

Lomborg, Bjørn. "Opinion; Time for a Smarter Approach to Global Warming; Investing in Energy R&D Might Work. Mandated Emissions Cuts Won't." *The Wall Street Journal* (Tues., December 15, 2009): A21.

Lomborg, Bjørn. "The View from Vanuatu on Climate Change; Torethy Frank Had Never Heard of Global Warming. She Is Worried About Power and Running Water." *The Wall Street Journal* (Fri., October 23, 2009): A19.

Maslow, Abraham H. *Motivation and Personality*. New York: Harper Brothers, 1954.

- Marx, Karl. "The British Rule in India." In *Archives of Empire: Volume I. From the East India Company to the Suez Canal*, edited by Mia Carter and Barbara Harlow,. Raleigh, NC: Duke University Press, 2003, pp. 117-18.
- Marx, Karl, and Friedrich Engels. *The Communist Manifesto*. New York: Tribeca Books, 2011 [first German edition was published 1848].
- McGonigal, Jane. *Reality Is Broken: Why Games Make Us Better and How They Can Change the World*. New York: Penguin Press, 2011.
- Menger, Carl. *Principles of Economics*. New York, NY: New York University Press, 1981 [first German edition was published in 1871].
- Michael, Robert T., and Gary S. Becker. "On the New Theory of Consumer Behavior." *Swedish Journal of Economics* 75, no. 4 (Dec. 1973): 378-96.
- Michaels, Patrick J., and Robert C. Balling, Jr. *The Satanic Gases: Cleaning the Air About Global Warming*. Washington, D.C.: Cato Institute, 2000.
- Miles, J.D., reporter. "Elderly Woman Dies from Heat after A/C Stolen." Dallas, CBS 11 News, August 5, 2011.
- Millard, Candice. *Destiny of the Republic: A Tale of Madness, Medicine and the Murder of a President*. New York: Doubleday, 2011.
- Moggridge, Donald E. *Maynard Keynes: An Economist's Biography*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Montesquieu, Baron Charles de Secondat. Edited by Basia Carolyn Miller, Anne M. Cohler, and Harold Samuel Stone. *Montesquieu: The Spirit of the Laws*, Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1989 (first French edition published in 1748).

- Moore, Stephen, and Julian L. Simon. "The Greatest Century That Ever Was: 25 Miraculous Trends of the Past 100 Years." In *Cato Policy Analysis*. Washington, D.C.: Cato Institute, 1999.
- Moore, Stephen, and Julian L. Simon. *It's Getting Better All the Time: 100 Greatest Trends of the Last 100 Years*. Washington, D.C.: Cato Institute, 2000.
- Mouawad, Jad. "Oil Survey Says Arctic Has Riches." *The New York Times* (Thurs., July 24, 2008): C1 & C4.
- Naik, Gautam. "Warmer Climate Gives Cheer to Makers of British Bubbly; Thanks to Milder Summers, England Takes Some Air out of France's Famous Tipple." *The Wall Street Journal* (Tues., May 11, 2010): A1 & A18.
- Oi, Walter. "The Welfare Implications of Invention." In *The Economics of New Goods*, edited by Robert J. Gordon and Timothy F. Bresnahan. Chicago: University of Chicago Press for National Bureau of Economic Research, 1997, pp. 109-141.
- O'Neill, Marie S., Rebecca Carter, Jonathan K. Kish, Carina J. Gronlund, Jalonne L. White-Newsome, Xico Manarolla, Antonella Zanobetti, and Joel D. Schwartz. "Preventing Heat-Related Morbidity and Mortality: New Approaches in a Changing Climate." *Maturitas* 64, no. 2 (October 2009): 98-103.
- O'Neill, Marie S., Antonella Zanobetti, and Joel Schwartz. "Modifiers of the Temperature and Mortality Association in Seven US Cities." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 157, no. 12 (2003): 1074-82.
- Ostro, Bart, Stephen Rauch, Rochelle Green, Brian Malig, and Rupa Basu. "The Effects of Temperature and Use of Air Conditioning on Hospitalizations." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 172, no. 9 (2010): 1053-61.

Ouroussoff, Nicolai. "Architecture Review; the Future: A More Watery New York." *The New York Times* (Fri., March 26, 2010): C21 & C23.

Post, Robert C. "The Myth Behind the Streetcar Revival." *American Heritage* 49, no. 3 (May-June 1998): 95-100.

Postrel, Virginia I. *The Future & Its Enemies: The Growing Conflict over Creativity, Enterprise & Progress*. New York, NY: The Free Press, 1998.

Rawls, John. *A Theory of Justice*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1971.

Reeves, Richard. "1954." *American Heritage* 45, no. 8 (December 1994): 30-38.

Reifman, Alan S., Richard P. Larrick, and Steven Fein. "Temper and Temperature on the Diamond: The Heat-Aggression Relationship in Major League Baseball." *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* 17, no. 5 (October 1991): 580-85.

Ren, Cizao, Marie S. O'Neill, Sung Kyun Park, David Sparrow, Pantel Vokonas, and Joel Schwartz. "Ambient Temperature, Air Pollution, and Heart Rate Variability in an Aging Population." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 173, no. 9 (May 1, 2011): 1013-21.

Revkin, Andrew C. "Global Warming Is Delaying Ice Age, Study Finds." *The New York Times* (Fri., September 4, 2009): A17.

Revkin, Andrew C. "A Push to Increase Icebreakers in the Arctic." *The New York Times*, First Section (Sun., August 17, 2008): 6.

Rhodes, Richard. *Visions of Technology: A Century of Vital Debate About Machines Systems and the Human World*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1999.

Richardson, Ruth. *The Making of Mr. Gray's Anatomy*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2008.

Rogot, Eugene, Paul D. Sorlie, and Eric Backlund. "Air-Conditioning and Mortality in Hot Weather." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 136, no. 1 (1992): 106-16.

- Romero, Simon. "The World; in Cuba, a Politically Incorrect Love of the Frigidaire." *The New York Times*, Week in Review Section (Sun., September 2, 2007): 3.
- Rothstein, Edward. "Exhibition Review; Hall of Human Origins; Searching the Bones of Our Shared Past." *The New York Times* (Fri., March 19, 2010): C25 & C32.
- Rupa, Basu, and D. Ostro Bart. "A Multicounty Analysis Identifying the Populations Vulnerable to Mortality Associated with High Ambient Temperature in California." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 168, no. 6 (September 2008): 632-32.
- Safer, Morley. "Prescott's War." *American Heritage* 42, no. 1 (Feb.-March 1991): 100-113.
- Sahakian, N., J. H. Park, and J. Cox-Ganser. "Respiratory Morbidity and Medical Visits Associated with Dampness and Air-Conditioning in Offices and Homes." *Indoor Air* 19, no. 1 (2009): 58-67.
- Schoer, L., and J. Shaffran. "A Combined Evaluation of Three Separate Research Projects on the Effects of Thermal Environment on Learning and Performance." *ASHRAE Transactions* 79 (1973): 97-108.
- Schultz, Eric B. "Weathermakers to the World---Behind the Scenes (Slightly)." In *The Occasional CEO* WebLog, URL: <http://theoccasionalceo.blogspot.com/2012/07/weathermakers-to-world-behind-scenes.html> (Sun., July 1, 2012a).
- Schultz, Eric B. *Weathermakers to the World: The Story of a Company. The Standard of an Industry*. Farmington, Conn.: Carrier Corp., 2012b.
- Schumpeter, Joseph A. *Capitalism, Socialism and Democracy*. 3rd ed. New York: Harper and Row, 1950 [first edition was 1942].
- Schwarz, Frederic D. "1881---President Garfield Shot." *American Heritage* 57, no. 3 (July 2006): 72-72.

Sengupta, Somini. "In Silt, Bangladesh Sees Potential Shield against Sea Level Rise." *The New York Times* (Fri., March 20, 2009): A6.

Severgnini, Beppe. *Ciao, America!: An Italian Discovers the U.S.* Translated by Giles Watson. pb ed. New York: Broadway Books, 2003.

Shakespeare Romeo and Juliet quote: "The day is hot, the Capulets abroad," [quoted in Anderson 2001, p. 33]

Shirky, Clay. *Cognitive Surplus: Creativity and Generosity in a Connected Age*. New York: Penguin Press, 2010.

Stafoggia, M., J. Schwartz, F. Forastiere, and C. A. Perucci. "Does Temperature Modify the Association between Air Pollution and Mortality? A Multicity Case-Crossover Analysis in Italy." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 167, no. 12 (2008): 1476-85.

Stein, Ben. "Ben Stein Cools Down." CBS Sunday Morning show, broadcast on July 6, 2008.

Stephens, Bret. "Freaked out over Superfreakonomics; Global Warming Might Be Solved with a Helium Balloon and a Few Miles of Garden Hose." *The Wall Street Journal* (Tues., October 27, 2009): A19.

Streever, Bill. *Cold: Adventures in the World's Frozen Places*. New York: Little, Brown and Company, 2009.

Tagliabue, John. "Lack of Air-Conditioning Cited in France's Death Toll." *New York Times* (Fri., Aug. 22, 2003): A3.

Teaford, Mark F. "Dissecting an Unheralded Alliance; a Classic Medical Text Bears One Man's Name, but It Was the Product of a True Collaboration." *Wall Street Journal* (Fri., March 27, 2009): W6.

Tierney, John. "The Autonomist Manifesto (or, How I Learned to Stop Worrying and Love the Road)." *The New York Times Magazine* (September 26, 2004): 57-65.

- Vandentorren, Stéphanie, Florence Suzan, Sylvia Medina, Mathilde Pascal, Adeline Maulpoix, Jean-Claude Cohen, and Martine Ledrans. "Mortality in 13 French Cities During the August 2003 Heat Wave." *American Journal of Public Health* 94, no. 9 (September 2004): 1518-20.
- Vonberg, Ralf-Peter, Petra Gastmeier, Björn Kenneweg, Hinrich Holdack-Janssen, Dorit Sohr, and Iris F. Chaberny. "The Microbiological Quality of Air Improves When Using Air Conditioning Systems in Cars." *BMC Infectious Diseases* 10 (2010): 146-51.
- Vrij, Aldert, Jaap Van der Steen, and Leendert Koppelaar. "Aggression of Police Officers as a Function of Temperature: An Experiment with the Fire Arms Training System." *Journal of Community & Applied Social Psychology* 4, no. 5 (December 1994): 365-70.
- Wargocki, Pawel, and David P. Wyon. "The Effects of Outdoor Air Supply Rate and Supply Air Filter Condition in Classrooms on the Performance of Schoolwork by Children (RP-1257)." *HVAC&R Research* 13, no. 2 (March 2007): 165-91.
- Wargocki, Pawel, and David P. Wyon. "Research Report on Effects of HVAC on Student Performance." *ASHRAE Journal* 48, no. 10 (October 2006): 22-28.
- Weightman, Gavin. *The Frozen-Water Trade: A True Story*. New York: Hyperion, 2003.
- Welty, Leah J., and Scott L. Zeger. "Are the Acute Effects of Particulate Matter on Mortality in the National Morbidity, Mortality, and Air Pollution Study the Result of Inadequate Control for Weather and Season? A Sensitivity Analysis Using Flexible Distributed Lag Models." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 162, no. 1 (2005): 80-88.
- Wilkowski, Benjamin M., Brian P. Meier, Michael D. Robinson, Margaret S. Carter, and Roger Feltman. "'Hot-Headed' Is More Than an Expression: The Embodied Representation of Anger in Terms of Heat." *Emotion* 9, no. 4 (August 2009): 464-77.
- Wilson, James Q. "Cars and Their Enemies." *Commentary* 104, no. 1 (July 1997): 17-23.

Wyly, Sam. *1,000 Dollars and an Idea: Entrepreneur to Billionaire*. New York: Newmarket Press, 2008.

Yeakel, Earl. "Pro-Cool and Anti-Cool." *American Heritage* 36, no. 1 (1984): 13.

Yergin, Daniel, and Joseph Stanislaw. *The Commanding Heights: The Battle for the World Economy*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1998.